Leading Effective Discussions Workshop
August 26, 2020

Video Transcript
[00:00:00]
>> Thank you all for joining us today. It's so great to see everyone here and hear your energy. I think most of you or many of you know me already, but I'm Grace Lyo, assistant dean and director for teaching and learning. And my team was created about a year ago to support all of your teaching and learning needs.

[00:00:19]
So we were created for this. It was as if John predicted the pandemic. I also wanna take a moment to thank the Jane and John McCoy Foundation for their support to make this and many of our events happen. So today we have with us an amazing lineup of faculty.

[00:00:40]
We were very lucky to get such a great group here. So first off, we have Kate Casey, who many of you already know she's a member of the Autumn Quarter Task Force and an associate professor. She was also a panelist for us in our May Faculty Panel and she did just an awesome five-minute demo of how she structures her course for online delivery.

[00:01:05]
Which we got rave review about, and are planning on making a standalone video. We also have with us Jim Ellis, who is a lecturer in management and the dean's liaison for lectures and teaching development. And we have Rob Siegel, who is a lecturer in management, also a member of the Autumn Quarter Task Force and a GSB MBA alum.

[00:01:33]
Go GSB. All right, we also have some great teaching and learning hub staff supporting this event. So Andrea, who you just heard gathering us all together. Andrea Taylor is going to be leading and facilitating this event. She is one of our learning experience designers here at the GSB.

[00:01:56]
And what our learning experience designers do is they work with faculty to help support the pedagogy and design element of their courses, whether they're online or in-person. So this could be through a one-off consultation, or it could be through a longer or extended duration. Andrea has over 15 years of experience teaching both in the classroom and fully online, so she knows what she's doing.

[00:02:24]
And we've also got Cindy Mazow who is a learning experience designer. Also, many years of experience. Has been at the Graduate School of Education here at Stanford. Elaine Chan Smith, who is a learning experience designer on the team. She has experience teaching in higher education. And Alison Brauneis who is associate director of teaching and learning programs.

[00:02:50]
She was hired as our pedagogy consultant. And she helped design the entire teaching and autumn series together with Andrea Taylor, and runs our teaching excellence orientation program. So with that, Andrea, I am going to hand it over to you.
>> Great, thank you so much, Grace. And I wanna thank, again, the faculty presenters for joining us today.

[00:03:15]
And thank you all for attending the session and leading discussions. This is part of that broader series that Grace is talking about called, teaching in autumn. And we have a lot of ideas in store for you. There's gonna be a lot. So take notes, write them down, whatever you need to do, but don't feel like you have to take every single one of them into your teaching this quarter.

[00:03:34]
But we do hope that you can try them out in our upcoming practice sessions. If you haven't scheduled one with us, please do so cuz that's where we're actually going to put that pedal to the metal with you and give you an opportunity to try out some of these brilliant ideas that faculty are gonna share with you today.

[00:03:50]
So if you haven't already, feel free to continue putting in what your anticipations are for the upcoming quarter or challenges you faced in general with leading discussions in the chat. Cuz we're actively looking at those, and that's just going to help us make sure that this conversation really is about you, and your needs, and all of that.

[00:04:11]
So that said, let me give you a few more norms for this. I did set this meeting up so that people are muted as they come in. And you don't have to remain muted when we're asking for discussion. So that's fine, but there may be times where your dog might be barking.

[00:04:30]
So if you find yourself off mute, go ahead and, [LAUGH] Mute yourself for that. Your video is also optional, but appreciated. This is how we build that community. This is how we get a chance to really get to know each other and connect with you too. And then the last one is, as Grace mentioned, we got a lot of people in the chat, so we've got people who are gonna answer questions and help you with pointing you to help documentation as well.

[00:04:54]
We'll feed those questions to the faculty so they can answer them during their sessions as well. So that said, let me talk about the agenda. So I know we have a variety of attendees here. We have a lot of different people. I know many of you are new to the GSB, teaching here for the first time this quarter, so welcome.

[00:05:11]
Round of applause. Thank you for joining us. And then, some of you are here who have taught quite a bit at the GSB, but maybe you didn't teach last spring. So this is gonna be your first online, how do I facilitate a class discussion, sort of venture for you?

[00:05:27]
And then, I have seen some people who are familiar faces who did actually teach in the spring, and I'm just glad to have you back. All of your questions are welcome. All of your expertise is welcome as well. So please keep those ideas flowing through the chat as we go through this.

[00:05:42]
As far as the agenda goes, I wanna briefly anchor us on some student perspectives, and think about how discussions really help with learning. And that's gonna be our anchor, as then, we spend most of the time of the session with the faculty hearing about their tricks, tips, experiments.

[00:05:58]
And so maybe they might tell you about some pitfalls to avoid in terms of online discussion facilitation. So questions and answers will be welcome throughout. I think each faculty member will have a section where they will just open up the floor for questions before we move to the next person.

[00:06:17]
So that will be invited. So just keep your ear out for that. Let's think about how students learn with discussions. I wanna start with this quote from Lev Vygotsky, a sociocultural theorists in learning. And he says, through others we become ourselves. So this notion is that we learn and we gain more traction of our learning as we engage with others.

[00:06:44]
It doesn't just sit in the vacuum as we sit in our own homes. So students are sitting in their own homes. How can we open up that door for them while you're hosting a class via Zoom? That's one of the things to think about. How can you go to this?

[00:07:01]
This photo is a dramatization. Just, [LAUGH], disclaimer there. So learning is really dependent on the sociocultural norms, and your class is a culture. It's where you're creating this culture here for students to engage with each other, to grapple with ideas, to debate them. And that's what you wanna do.

[00:07:20]
That's what you're going for. So I'm gonna move out of this dramatized version, [LAUGH] Of a class and get into actual student quotes here. Some really good ones too, so I'll read them. I know this might be small on some of your screens, so I'll go ahead and read them.

[00:07:35]
The first one, from Bianca Jackson. The one thing that was really effective in online learning environment was when the professor was able to create that intimate connection early on that made you feel like you were walking into the classroom, rather than signing in on your laptop miles away.

[00:07:57]
From Will Robins. I really appreciate when the Chat section of the Zoom is enabled. I noticed that there were some classes in the spring where it was disabled, and it made it difficult to ask clarifying questions and made class feel more one sided. And then finally, but not finally, we had a lot of great feedback from students but these are just three from Stephanie Liu.

[00:08:23]
I find myself most engaged when instructors employed a show-host personality in online classes, mixing educational content with relatable humor and anecdotes. And here's my favorite part, because I was engaged, I learned. And I think that that's our goal today is to really talk about how can you engage students and more specifically, engage students in the culture of your class and the content.

[00:08:52]
So I'm gonna just walk you through a little bit of a scenario thinking. I know you have a lot of different experience in here with leading discussions. So I wanna just think through like hypothetically how one might unfold in your class. So you might start off the class by really setting those norms.

[00:09:09]

You want students to know what is the topic you're talking about and how you're going to manage it. So are you gonna use the hand raised tool? Are you gonna use the chat and just draw some ideas out of it? Or are you gonna do 100% cold calls?

[00:09:22]
So setting that stage is important. Giving them context on the topic and also be important, too, for them to start framing their answers. Then as you start calling some answers or some thoughts from students, you might find that some of the students are staying at the superficial level.

[00:09:37]
So you need to employ some discussion strategies that are going to just draw a little bit more out, like, how did you arrive at that conclusion? Where did you see that in the case? So really getting some more ideas from the students. And then as you move on through the class, you might find that you're hearing from just one group of students or one student or one perspective.

[00:09:58]
So you want to employ strategies that are going to broaden those perspectives and get those deeper answers from other people. So you might say, okay, I heard a lot of people who said option a, but I wanna hear from the side who said option b. And then tell me if you've heard this before.

[00:10:15]
Maybe a student gets a little off topic and you find that the student might be giving you a laundry list of ideas that aren't quite relevant to the topic or maybe you only want to focus on one or two. So you want to choose a strategy that's going to just help them refocus and wrangle them back towards that.

[00:10:34]
So that's where you're going to just refocus by just asking more follow up questions or telling them hey, we're going to talk about x today. But I think when we come back next week, we'll talk about y. And then a final strategy I want to talk about that you might do in your class and the arc of the classes.

[00:10:51]
How you help them synthesize the ideas by closing the loop, summarizing, getting students to start making those connections to the relevance of this topic to another topic. So these are what we like to call in the Teaching and Learning Hub, discussion moves. And I like to say that these facilitation moves are where you become as the the professor, as the facilitator, that conduit between your content and the students' learning.

[00:11:20]
So that's what your goal is. So I have a few of these conduits on the call here today who are going to talk through their strategies on how they're really making this meaningful connections with students like this. So, we're gonna go through alphabetical order. I do wanna point out that we had originally thought about talking about hybrid in this session today.

[00:11:40]
But with this week's announcement, it being pretty clear that what everybody probably wants to hear about most is just, how do you handle the online? So Jonathan Levav was gonna speak a little bit to hybrid today, but as a collective, we decided let's hold off on that. We'll focus on online, and that's what these folks are going to do today.

[00:12:00]

So, to that end, I'm gonna stop sharing my screen. I'm going to hand it over to Kate, who's going to kick us off with some of her strategies.

>> Right, okay. So, yeah, I taught in the spring, three sections of a large class, so there are 80 students per section.

[00:12:21]
And a typical class has both, some lecture. I rely a lot on slides and then also trying to facilitate discussions amongst 80 people online. So, I'm gonna share my screen I've put together just some really short thoughts here. Let's see, can you see this? Great. Okay, so I kind of wanted to just be very practical and think specifically about discussions on Zoom, the fully online format.

[00:12:54]
So I've organized my thoughts in three areas. The first is visualizing the classroom, second fostering participation, and the third, drawing in diverse perspectives. And so the first one was gonna be very Zoom focused, just trying to get a quick handle on what this part of the technology looks like.

[00:13:10]
And then the other two are really thinking about your techniques and strategies you're using in in-person classroom. What are some effective ways to transfer them into the online environments. So on this first one, just visualizing the classroom, if you wanna hold a discussion, an effective discussion, you have to be able to see who's in the room and they, of course, have to be able to see you.

[00:13:31]
So I wannna share, this is me teaching from the man cave which is part of my garage at home, in the Spring. And I just wanna point out some things that, just kind of the basics of your setup that are really important. So here you see, I have my laptop but I also have an external monitor.

[00:13:50]
And on the external monitor, I have zoom gallery view of all of the students, right. So you cannot lead a discussion if you can't see what the students are doing. Now keep in mind, on even the size of monitor that I have, you can put 49 faces on there.

[00:14:07]
So I periodically have to scroll to the right to see the balance, 30 students that were on there. So you gotta get basic things and you really need to, the bigger the better that you can see them. I also, let me see here. So, the other thing is, to be able to see them they have to have their videos on, right?

[00:14:27]
So they have to have their video on, focused, looking at you. So how do you make sure? Well, basically you just have to work from the start to establish very strong norms that students, you're not present unless you're online and your video is on. So how do I do that, specifically?

[00:14:44]
Well, I made the announcement in Canvas, I talked about on the first day, I made it very explicit that participation, their grade for participation, relied in a large part on being present, right? Being present, having your video on and speaking up. So tracking this, we took periodic screenshots and if your video is not on and the majority, then you're absent.

[00:15:07]

And I think it's also just really clearly communicating this, from the beginning, is that this is how you're gonna run your show. So then I mentioned I use slides a lot, like this. So in order for me to be able to see my slides, I had my laptop with the slides view on, right?

[00:15:23]
So I can see the slides and students are looking at the slides. But I always have the students in the background, right? So I can always check in and you can try to take the pulse of the room. It's obviously harder than when you can see them in person.

[00:15:39]
But you know, you got both the slides and the classroom view. And then just some other things, like I'm standing up and this is a personal preference of standing up right now. I stand up because that's what I do in the classroom. It's also easier for me to bring my own energy and project it into the computer when I'm standing up and I feel like I can move freely.

[00:16:00]
And while energy might not sound directly relevant for the discussion, you have to just keep capturing their attention and engaging them with what you're saying what's What's going on, it's just really hard to pay attention over a long period of time. So the final thing I wanna say is, so in this picture, this is a bit of a mistake.

[00:16:20]
So part of establishing a rapport is looking at each other online. So right now, I am looking straight into the camera, which is at the top of my laptop. So if you're looking it, should look like I am looking you straight in the eye. So if you look at where I had this here, you can see my laptop is actually too low in this picture.

[00:16:38]
And so, now, I have a few extra books, you'll see there's books, the monitors on books, so the laptop really should be raised up a little bit. And so, the report kind of works than two ways. One, you actually wanna be looking at the students, or the laptops kind of overlapping with the gallery view.

[00:16:54]
So I can see their face, and then, from their perspective, it looks like I'm looking directly at them. This not perfect cuz you're looking slightly above where the camera is, but that just helps them helps establish rapport between the professor and the students. So just kind of like basics, visualizing the classroom from your perspective.

[00:17:14]
I think it's also important to think about, turn it around, and think about what they see. So this is what, students are gonna be logging in on a variety of devices. But I think you can presume that the mobile device is gonna be a laptop. And laptops have very small screens.

[00:17:30]
So if they're just kind of a default, Speaker View Settings, and you're sharing slides, this is what they're gonna see. And you might be looking at me like this now, depending on how you, I think it's webinars, it's configured a little differently. But you can see, I'm tiny, and my slides are enormous, right?

[00:17:46]

Which is kind of fine, when you're, when you're just narrating over slides. But when a student asked me a question, why I have my slides up, the student is tiny too, right? So it just creates a lot of distance between everyone. So there's a few different techniques you can do this, one, you can work with students so that they put their [INAUDIBLE] side by side mode, so that they kind of adjust how it faces versus the [INAUDIBLE].

[00:18:10]
But what I think is more important is [INAUDIBLE] get up close and personal. So when you wanna shift from providing lectures and narrating slides to having an engaged discussion, what I would suggest is stop sharing your slides, and I'm gonna do this now. So if I stop sharing, and if you have speaker view, depending on how you set it up, if you have an on speaker view, I should, and if you don't, if you had on gallery view, put on speaker view for a second.

[00:18:38]
And you should see me, where actually I'm seeing Andrea, okay, why am I seeing Andrea? [LAUGH] Anyway, you see me big notes, and then, tell me, somebody say, do you see me large, now?
>> Yes.
>> Okay, good. All right, so it's just my own zoom is weirdly configured.

[00:18:55]
Whoo, yes. So you should see me big, right, and so, now, you should feel like you're engaging with me more closely, but it's not just me. So for example, If I wanna bring someone into the discussion, and I wanna say, okay, like how, the air quality at my house is pretty good.

[00:19:11]
So let's say, I wanna call on Suzy, like Suzy, if you can unmute yourself, I'm gonna bring you in. Tell me how's the air quality? It looks like you're You're on campus.
>> Yeah, I think it's good. I have my windows closed.
>> Yeah, great, so now, Susan's huge, right.

[00:19:26]
So you see Suzy, I see Suzy. I've never met Suzy in person, but now I feel like I have a sense of who she is, what she looks like. As different students pop, in and out, they can talk to each other. Like if I were to say, like Rob, can you jump in here and say, say hi to Suzy?

[00:19:43]

>> Hi Suzy, how do you like that office, you've decorated it the same way that mine is decorated at the GSB, all his extensive books on the bookshelf.
>> I like it a lot, I have a lot of faces to fill, [LAUGH].
>> That was great, but you wanna see, like so now, Rob and Suzy can have a bit of a debate with each other in class, and whenever they talk, the technology is really great, it's just picking them up.

[00:20:10]
And when you have, when you're not sharing your slides, and you have this on speaker view, they just look enormous, right? And that, I think one of the students comments was like, you're not feeling now, like I'm 10 miles away from Suzy, but that we're actually pretty close together and we think about, is Zoom in some ways better.

[00:20:26]

It's totally seamless the way it captured these voices. And then, you rarely disclosed your students face when you have a big classroom with 80 students inside, so that's kind of a benefit. Okay, so that's just like the stuff I wanted to say, that just like super basic, about like how to set it up the technology to have effective discussion.

[00:20:46]
So I just wanna re-share, just to go through a few more points. Now, these points are going to be more along the lines of what you would do anyway, in the regular classroom, and how you can sort of pivot that in an effective way to the online classroom.

[00:21:06]
So the first thing I wanna talk about is like accountability and transparency. So when I'm in the in person classroom, I do a lot of cold calling, and I actually thought, I think it's Amber who raised this in chat earlier. Kind of a question about cold versus warm calling.

[00:21:20]
So I'm a very aggressive cold caller in the in person classroom. One thing I changed in sort of traveling this over to online, is it made my calls warmer, and that I posted the list of the cold calls in Canvas alongside the reading. So everyone knows what to expect when I'm calling someone out.

[00:21:38]
If you're prepared or not prepared, right, so you still get the same incentives for preparation. But I feel like it's a little bit less intense, because they're not coming out of the blue, and so, then a lot of the other discussion I have in classes more, you're allowing people just to raise hand and make comments.

[00:21:54]
So when I'm gonna teach in spring, I'm actually gonna have, if we're still online, I'm gonna have like a lot more cool questions, and you kind of pepper them throughout the whole, my sessions were 80 minutes. So that is just, don't, don't, relax on the accountability and transparency, or you're really just going to lose the students, cuz if they're not prepared, you are not gonna be able to have an effective discussion.

[00:22:18]
The second thing is like don't let them manage participants list in zoom, bossy around. Okay, so what do I mean by this, when you pull up the participants, essentially, whoever raises their hand first, is gonna shoot to the top of the list. And so, you don't need to call on the first person with their hand up, right?

[00:22:34]
That's just rewarding whoever's fastest. I'd usually like take a minute, like if I posed an open question. You get a lot of participants up, and then, you can be selective, and calling on, who you wanna hear from at that point, right? So I always prioritizing people that haven't said anything that day.

[00:22:51]
Always prioritize, if someone raises their hand I haven't heard from them recently, or at all, I always prioritize calling on them first, and so, don't feel like you just have to take them as they come, you can pick and choose. You can also, if you get a bunch of like the usual suspects who always participate in the other seven up there, and they've already all spoken, you can say no, I got clear the list, everyone, put your hands back down.

[00:23:13]

Now, only raise your hand if you haven't said anything yet today. And then, you might have to kind of wait an awkward 90 seconds for people to start raising their hands. But those people have something to say, right, and they're prepared, and they're ready to talk. So those are some of the things you can think about.

[00:23:30]
And then, the third one is just how do you think about like breakout rooms as a complimentary venue for having smaller group discussions, right, so I have 80 students in my class. This kind of unwieldy for to have a discussion, running the whole time. So breakout rooms are really fantastic.

[00:23:47]
And one of the things I like about them is like just the functionality of zoom that you don't have in person classrooms are two things. One, they're like instantaneous, right? So you don't have 10, I don't know, two or three minutes, everyone moving their chairs, and finding their teams, and you can do it, randomly match.

[00:24:03]
So you're getting people that are not sitting next to each other, so you're creating connections across the classroom that you might not have when you're breaking into small groups inside the classroom, without the admin of randomly assigning, and everybody has to find each other. So but the way some of the things I experimented with are just putting a lot of structure and accountability on the breakout room.

[00:24:25]
So whenever I send people to a breakout room I usually post a slide or a Word doc that had the set of questions I wanted them to talk about. Sometimes like manipulating a slide to get an answer and coming and to share back. So then I always say pick a scribe, and then I'm gonna randomly pick scribes from groups and I'm gonna cold call you to share what you've done in the breakout room.

[00:24:47]
So again, it's like this cold call this incentive structure, but it's a little softer because you have a chance to volunteer as a scribe or not. So then when we reconvene you can have all the scribes put their hand up and then you randomly pick which of the scribes you wanna hear from.

[00:25:03]
They can share their screen and then it's also a little bit more collaborative. Because when the students are sharing the screen it's like they get the opportunity to be the professor and you're kind of taking the back seat. It's a nice dynamic. The other thing is when they're in break out rooms, you can drop in, right?

[00:25:16]
You might not be able to get to all of them your CA might not be able to get to all of them. But then you can have a little chats with four or five people for a couple minutes. They can ask you questions, you can just hear them interact with each other and it's a way to get up close and personal in a big classroom environment.

[00:25:33]
Okay so those are all fairly standard things that you would do in the in person classroom thinking about how to do it online. And I'm just gonna continue with that and thinking about how do I make sure everybody's voice gets out in a discussion, and it's not the usual suspects every time?

[00:25:49]

So these are just some very practical things that I tried. So first on the first day, I sent out a Google Doc, that they published in real time just listing any relevant experience they had to the class. So the class covers a bunch of different countries and also covers work with government.

[00:26:05]
So I had them specify anything they had done in those categories. Then throughout the quarter I did this in the in person classroom, but I think it worked online too. They have a view from the trenches series where I asked them if we're talking about Ethiopia. And I have someone who worked in Ethiopia I'm gonna say okay, you get five minutes at the end of class to present your perspective on what it was like to work in Ethiopia.

[00:26:25]
I don't do this every class I probably would only do it in maybe even like a quarter of the classes. And it's only the last five minutes and then you can leave the room open and the students can ask each other questions about their participation. But when I'm selecting those a I was selecting them for relevance but b it's like a double bonus.

[00:26:40]
If you can pick somebody who hasn't been participating very much, then they get this platform to showcase their experience in a way that's relevant. And it's just kind of some of the most emotionally rewarding five minutes of sessions. When do you get someone who hasn't been participating and gets to star in the spotlight.

[00:26:57]
The other basic stuff so I tell the students that I do my cold callers with a random number generator, which is true. But I also as the sessions go by, I compliment the random numbers with purposeful selections, right? So I keep track of how many times everybody's talking.

[00:27:13]
The CAs are quite useful for this. So really recommend getting an MBA too to help you as a CA cuze they tend to know a lot about the students in your class. So they can also ping you and say, so and so's actually worked in Argentina. You might not know this from the Google Doc but I bet they have something to say.

[00:27:28]
Then you can also have your CAs kind of nudge people, ping people you can say okay, look at the list we're at day six. Anybody that hasn't said anything yet in the quarter would you just ping them today and say I've noticed you have not said anything. Why don't you try to get on the floor today?

[00:27:44]
So it's just kind of ways that you could use the CA and these private chats through zoom is a pretty kind of non confrontational low stakes way for CAs to communicate and encourage people to speak up. And then I'll just say one last thing and then I'll stop.

[00:28:01]
I have a lot of rules and norms around accountability and I'm very transparent with them. But in a way I have sort of a strict approach, but I pair that with a lot of compassion and leniency given the craziest situations that the students are in, right? So I mentioned I always have the video on.

[00:28:22]

I have the CAs picking up your videos off, I just don't have a good internet connection never penalise someone for things like that or like I just have a terrible day. There's no way I can like put my face on the screen. That's fine, right? And one example I had a student that hadn't said anything the whole quarter.

[00:28:40]
And she came to my office hours and she was just like, I can't, I'm petrified, I can't do it. English was a second language you've had a coach for the previous two quarters, but the coach was suspended due to COVID. And she's like I just cannot possibly get myself to talk, and I said well here let's strike a deal.

[00:28:54]
I was like I'm gonna call on you you're gonna be the first question when I cold call on Thursday. [LAUGH] So she was really prepared like, God, she just gave a kick ass answer. She was excited, everyone was excited and you can mix in some of this stuff.

[00:29:09]
Like bend your own rules a little bit just to help make sure people are struggling to get their voices out to have an easier use your pap there. So now follow my own advice I'm gonna stop sharing my screen so we can have a quick Q&A or we can pass over to Jim, whatever makes most sense.

[00:29:26]

>> Thank you so much Kate. I think because of the interest of time, I'm gonna pass it to Jim but let people type questions in the chat to you. And then I think we might have some time at the end where we can have some more verbal discussion as well.

[00:29:40]

>> Great.
>> So without further ado Jim, the stage is yours.
>> Well, thanks. It's tough to fall kate. So I'll just offer some thoughts I don't have any slides, but I'll give you some of our experiences from the spring is what seemed to work best in the pieces.

[00:29:56]
We didn't necessarily start this way but this is how we arrived. I'm gonna echo a couple things that were said before Andrea, starting with kind of practice, practice, practice. I have to tell you we did 3 or 4 sessions I was a student in some other people's sessions.

[00:30:11]
And I can't emphasize enough how helpful that was. It really is a different rhythm. It's a really different flow a lot of your natural instincts, even if you're an experienced instructor. I need to think about how to translate those same objectives Kate was talking about keeping the energy up.

[00:30:25]
In the enthusiasm going but they're not always kind of immediately intuitive. I just wanna echo setting the norms we put out a document to students, we also went over a slide on the first day of class. And we found students to be great at adhering to those. If we noticed somebody wasn't there, we sent them a note after the fact that we usually got incredibly positive responses.

[00:30:50]

But I think the key there is being upfront, transparent and then being consistent about the application of it over the course of the quarter. I just wanna talk about a little bit about starting setting the tone and framing. My words of advice for what they're worth is I just be really careful not to apologize for the situation in which we find ourselves.

[00:31:13]
We heard from students kind of at the end of the quarter they were a little worn out of being apologized to. And reinforcing that this isn't necessarily what they signed up for from a GSB experience. I certainly prefer live there are actually a couple of things that you can do.

[00:31:30]
And I'll talk about those in a second in zoom that aren't really available to you so we are trying this quarter to emphasize look, we're gonna get to do some things. We can't normally do breakouts, we're gonna have some guests who normally aren't able to make it. We're gonna have some participants.

[00:31:46]
This gonna be a great quarter without kind of setting their expectations that you should be disappointed for what's coming. But really there's some great stuff that's coming up ahead. I think one of the things at least for us that we found in the spring was that planning what you're gonna deliver in terms of course content, redefining what your teaching objectives are.

[00:32:11]
And having a specific game plan for how we are going to keep the energy high was really important for us and that. Actually, you know, as all of us have experienced kind of staring at a screen, and you know, you unfortunately having to look at me for 10 minutes can be tedious.

[00:32:27]
But what we tried to do is figure out how we're going to break that up. We planned out every session where we're going to use polls where we're going to ask questions in chat. Where do we want? I had a co-instructor, even places where we're normally pretty organic in a live class asked people, hey, I need, would you mind taking two minutes to talk about this?

[00:32:47]
You've made this point in years past. So we really planned out ways to kinda break that up and what would normally say I would deliver in a class. By teaching my co-instructor, we carve off five minutes for him just in order to change the screen, change the tone, change the pace.

[00:33:05]
That desire to keep energy high and the pace moving pretty quickly led to a couple other things that we did. I'm much like Katherine, we're firm believers in cold calls. We didn't use warm calls as much, We did it kind of within the session so I'd say hey Rob, in a minute I'm gonna come back to you, it seems like doesn't like what's going on, Rob I want you to think about the counter side to that argument.

[00:33:32]
So we did a little bit of warm calling but we found cold calling to be super helpful in terms of keeping students engaged. We told them up front we're gonna cold call, much to Kate's kind of closing point of being willing to be flexible with your situation. We told everybody hey, we realize some of you are in places where you may have poor internet or there may be some other things going on.

[00:33:57]
Let us know ahead of time in class if you're not gonna be available our intent and cold calling isn't to. Embarrassed you are attempting cold calling is to keep the class moving. And we found that it really helps. And we did have some students say, hey, I've got a relative that's sick or something.

[00:34:12]
Something's going on. And we were usually pretty lacks about letting people off the hook for things like that. We also our class all of our class have guests, usually the protagonist from the CEO or the founder of a company. In part of that planning process, we strategically thought about where we wanted those guests to participate our kind of typical course of action will be have the case discussion, and then you let the guest comment at the end.

[00:34:44]
We really tried to break that up. So at the end of study question one, we would give the guests a pretty clear set of requests or instructions. Hey, would you talk about these three topics? Don't talk about this fourth one. I want to cover that in the next study question, and we'll ask you to jump in and we found that to be really helpful.

[00:35:03]
Students, I think, appreciate it. It kept the class moving. And we didn't dump kinda 20 or 30 minutes at the end of the course at the end of the session on a guest who then had to be the give us a little equate. To, to a Zoom audience.

[00:35:19]
Another thing that we found really, really helped was the ability to sequence the conversation using chat. And I either we either used our co-instructor or our course assistant in that process. So for example, we have an underperforming, this is a situation from the spring we have an underperforming employee.

[00:35:43]
In first what we'd like to talk about is you know do we need to do anything is now the time right? Secondly, if we need to do something, what is it? Is it coaching them demoting them? Changing their supervisor, fire them. But I had a particular we had a particular order in which we wanted to discuss it.

[00:36:00]
And with and with chat you can actually do that. So I would say RTA was Helen, I'd say Helen who thinks this is not the right time for us to be engaged and she would be monitoring chat, and we'd start the conversation where I wanted, and then we'd say, well, who thinks, you know how, who thinks coaching is the right next step.

[00:36:19]
So she would kind of have the spreadsheet in front to to Kate's points who knew who was talking frequently, or who hadn't spoken, and she'd allocate distribute. Not based on whose hand went up first, but by the topic they were interested in discussing and we found that as opposed to cold calling somebody and then taking the conversation off on a tangent we were able to really focus and sequence the conversation.

[00:36:44]
It wasn't every single case question, but there were some of them where that order actually mattered. It was difficult to go back and cover a after you've already talked about CMD. So we found that to be really helpful.

We shared our game plan with our guests and we're really clear about where they wanted them to participate.

[00:37:05]
I will tell you this is my experience but also talking to a number of other instructors who taught in the spring. If for some reason or another just takes longer to get around the bases and deliver on your teaching objectives. My recommendation for us we will if you're staying in the same time format, I know a number of courses having shortened from 105 to 80.

[00:37:25]
So I think that's a that's a different set of issues altogether. But we found it was about 25% to a third less material that we could cover in a Zoom format. In part that was because we were doing things like polls and we were doing things like chat, but we just we just found we just found planning for that much less content is really helpful.

[00:37:49]
And you can always have a question in the back I see Deborah just texted. We told people that we turned off pub, we turned off private chat. We did exactly the same thing if you wanted to chat, chat to the whole class so everyone can see it. We cut off that, that private chat.

[00:38:05]
You know, one of the things that was that was mentioned that's a bonus of Zoom. That's really difficult to do in a classroom. Typically, if you have 70 or 80 students is breakout sessions. We had our course assistant, manage the breakouts, I would be really thoughtful about having somebody help you set up and do that.

[00:38:24]
If somebody logged in on a telephone and using video from their computer, sometimes they get set. They don't get sent to the same breakout room. So there's just some logistics that having somebody navigate that for you is really helpful. We went and jumped into the breakout rooms as we could my co-instructor said you go into the even ones, I'll go into the odd ones.

[00:38:45]
We even had the guest who was willing to jump into some of those and talk about the situation and with it within the breakout and I think it was a way to have that one on one personal connection. For us. That was really, really important. I think one of the things students and faculty are missing in this kind of new world and format is that connection and relationship that is so important for those of us who were there, but I think the students are longing for it.

[00:39:15]
We really did try to create those opportunities to have that interaction, a couple specific things we did. Was one we left the class running I mean normally in our course once the official class comes over usually students come up and talk to the instructors and guests. So we left the Zoom running for an extra 15 or 20 minutes.

[00:39:42]
And asked our guests if they would plan on spending that extra time just talking informally with students. All of our guests said yes, and I would say on average, more than 50% of the class stuck around for 15 minutes which was nice. It tells you that and we got positive feedback from students on that.

[00:40:01]
I would say we found incredibly rewarding for a personal standpoint but also connection with students as we set up a bunch of lunchtimes, our TA facilitated it. So we had small groups and we did six or fewer. Students at a time. We had one hour lunches and any and all topics whether it was case related, whether it was COVID, whether it was the press, whatever the topic was, we're all kind of open and on the table.

[00:40:29]
Sometimes we just talked about family and kids and stuff like that. That was super. And then lastly, I'd say find a way to get feedback from your students early on. We found students, we did it in the content, we framed it as faculty been working really hard over the summer to set up their classes.

[00:40:47]
They put a lot of thought and effort into how they're gonna deliver their content. You're gonna have a bunch of classes this quarter, if you find something in one of your other sections that's really helpful and useful, feel free to bring it on. We can't promise we're gonna implement all of them but we'd love to hear what you're finding to be effective, or what you think we might be able to change.

[00:41:07]
And generally within, from one class to the next, we tried to turn that around with thank you for this advice, here's what we're doing, here's how we're going to change it. So I think all those things have that connection. And then I guess lastly I would add I think students were enormously appreciative of extended office hours.

[00:41:25]
They were enormously appreciative of kind of we did even more kind of email comments and feedback to students in class. And I think that helped increase the level of connection and engagement, as a result engagement from students. So that's it, that's all I got.
>> Thank you so much, Jim.

[00:41:44]
Lots of gems in Jim's presentation there. So what I think we'll do is we'll continue with the same tone of like, feel free to shoot Jim more questions in the chat and we'll have a little bit of time when Rob's done with his segment to open up a further discussion.

[00:42:01]
So Rob, I'm gonna hand it over to you to take it away.
>> All right since Kate and Jim basically talked about everything that I was gonna talk about, I have nothing to say. So what I'm gonna do is I'm going to refer to what other people have.

[00:42:14]
There is a spot on the teaching and learning hub that talks about golden nuggets from the spring quarter. And so what we synthesize is a lot of the feedback we got from the instructors. And I wanna highlight a few things that other people said that I think were really important and then I'll share with you some of the things that I did when I taught.

[00:42:32]
The first was Jim talked about breakout rooms. One of the instructors did a very interesting thing that whenever the deliverable was, whoever was the scribe, they had them do it in a Google Doc. And what that allowed the instructor to do was over, let's say you have them in a breakout room for seven or eight minutes.

[00:42:47]
You could actually see people making progress, or not. And that was a way to kind of hold the students accountable. They also knew that other people were seeing them as they did their work. So just kinda being aware of that kind of tool where you break them off for a little bit because the worst thing happens to a breakout room.

[00:43:04]
Maybe you get five people who don't know each other that well, and they're trying to figure out how to interact with each other. There's no hierarchy. It's kinda like those dysfunctional study groups that you might remember from when you were a student. And then they run out of time to come back and do a report.

[00:43:17]
So that was one tool that I thought was pretty good. Another thing and Jim talked about, this is an important point. And Kate also has talked about this in the past. You get through 25% less material. And part of that is just not only we're all learning this tool like for example, I'm staring at the camera right now, okay?

[00:43:36]
We're sorry about this. I can't see you. You're like Hollywood Squares you below me. If I look down now I'm looking at your faces but I'm not making eye contact with you on the camera. Now I'm doing this I'm talking to a camera, this is television. And so like, I can't tell if someone confused if someone laughing at my jokes.

[00:43:52]
If somebody, angry at something I said cuz I provoked them the right way. And so there's sometimes you miss some of these cues. And even for example, if you're asking somebody a question, they drone on and on and on, it's kind of rude to interrupt them, like you can interrupt them in your classroom because.

[00:44:07]
You could smile and do all sorts of things like that. And because of these little subtle things, those are the reasons you don't get through as much information. I'd like to encourage you, especially the AQTF, we'd like to encourage you think about parts of your class that you can prerecord ahead of time.

[00:44:22]
Think about other lectures that you may have a 10 or 15 minute lecture that you do every class. If you could put it on video and we have studio set up at the GSB for this, you can then say okay, you all watch the videos, I assigned it for this class session, let's talk about it now.

[00:44:37]
And then your time with them becomes far more interactive. It's a little bit of a flipped classroom, but it allows you basically to take a chunk of your class, put it into prework, and then spend the time interacting with the students. Jim talked about the time before class and after class.

[00:44:52]
I was one of these people that when I in the fall, I teach an 8 AM class, I would try to get into the classroom about 7:20. Get my boards ready, get set up. And then when a few students would come in and struggle and that was my time to chit chat with them.

[00:45:04]
I would log on to my Zoom sessions generally about 15 to 20 minutes early. And inevitably a few people would come in and we'd shoot the breeze. And that helps you build that personal bond. That's really what

makes the GSB so special. The students right now are just starving for time, not only with each other, but actually with us.

[00:45:21]
Believe it or not, it took a pandemic to realize they actually miss being in the classroom. True, it's actually what they've told us this. Couple of other things that I wanna highlight and then I'm gonna share with you some of my things. The chart function when it's good, it's really good, and sometimes it can be kinda dab.

[00:45:39]
My best experience is I taught three classes in the spring quarter and my second section of entrepreneurial finance. I had just a few students who were really on fire and into the subject and they would go through on the chat and you would see some really good debates about what was being discussed back and forth.

[00:45:56]
And they were being agreeing or disagreeing with me or with the guests or with the students. And it was all very respectful, but it was really a good engagement though, that the way the tool became actually even much better and things that we couldn't do in the classroom.

[00:46:09]
So when it can go well, I decided to just let it run and in particular that one, okay. A few things for me that I did, so for example, I'm an actually cold call somebody right now, Georgia Kogan. I mean, I know you're on here somewhere. In fact, I can see you, George.

[00:46:24]
I want you to come off of mute. George, who do you think is the greatest leader? The semiconductor industry ever had. George what do you think?
>> I would say Andy Grove Rob?
>> Andy, tell me more, why would you say Andy Grove is the best leader?
>> Well, I think he was your boss, wasn't he?

[00:46:43]

>> Well, yeah, okay? But aside from that, George, why was Andy Grove the best? Well, I think he was a brilliant strategist. He was a taskmaster. He ruled with an iron fist, but he had a velvet glove.
>> Come on George, let's cut through the crap you don't really believe that do you?

[00:47:01]
Let's face it he was a total dictator. Robert Burgelman was really the great teacher right, and and the great strategist and he never had anybody past the microprocessors. Can you please respond to that?
>> He never had anybody. I'm sorry I didn't he never had anybody do what?

[00:47:17]

>> He never got past microprocessors. That was the only thing they ever did at Intel. It was a one.
>> That was probably his biggest failing Rob, was that he never, he didn't leave an organization that could evolve properly.
>> All right, so two things in George's and mine going back and forth.

[00:47:32]

George and I obviously both teach with Robert Burgelman. But number one, I said, tell me more. It's just a simple tool to get him to like not give me a two word answer. And then like challenge him. You don't really believe that do you? And George obviously has more intelligence in his pinky than I have in my whole body.

[00:47:47]
And then he can respond but these kids that we teach who are adults. They're all very smart and they can engage with us. Don't be afraid to challenge them. They'll come back at you and you'll see them shine and blossom. I think a couple of things finally, you'll notice I'm standing up when I talk.

[00:48:01]
This allows me to create some space here. I wanna encourage you, you saw how Kate stands up when she teaches. I find this to be so much better. I find that I can move around and you can see me waving my hands around it and kind of get that sense of Yeah I'm kind of hyperactive and overly caffeinated but that's what you're trying to bring, when you're actually doing this on zoom.

[00:48:20]
The CIA's are absolutely positively critical the CIA's are critical your course assistance. You won't be able to take role you won't be able to do all those things and by the way. Coach your CAs, Kate talked about how she wants to bring in people who haven't spoken. Don't forget to coach, the course assistants and all the things that we know that they don't know.

[00:48:41]
So for example, give me a balance of men and women, give me a balance of MBAs. And when we have ms extras, make sure the ms extras get to speak, make sure I bring in the students from the outside. You wanna make sure you're bringing diverse opinions in, but some of the things that we know to do, make sure that you coach your CPAs to do it.

[00:48:57]
I think the last thing I'll say I on Tuesdays and Thursdays in the month of April, talked at the screen for five hours. Literally, I would stare at this camera for five hours, It was absolutely exhausting. I had to take naps between my second and third class, even if we're only 20 minutes.

[00:49:13]
So remember to you, you're actually, you're trying to bring energy, you're trying to be fun, you're trying to do all these things to create a great experience. It takes energy to put out energy, and because we don't get any of the human interaction, we are three dimensional creatures.

[00:49:26]
Everything right now is two dimensional. It's actually much more tiring for us to be doing stuff like this. So just keep that in mind that you will need to bring energy and you'll need to make yourself have the time to rest. If you're doing back to back classes my apologies if you've only got 10 minutes between them.

[00:49:42]
But if you can get 30 minutes like get out of your office and get out of your teaching studio. Go outside and get some sunshine chug another thing of coffee, but it's exhausting to do this. Alright, I'm gonna stop there just because of time Andre, I know that I ran a little bit over.

[00:49:58]

>> You're good.
>> I'll turn it back to you.
>> I this is all your time I want, I want it to be mostly you guys, so we're actually going to turn it over to questions. I think we might make this more of a panel discussion at this point.

[00:50:09]
We do have a few minutes to take some questions I wanna point out one from amber about. Because Rob, you mentioned something about how to get, students might get long winded and so she's asking if anybody has tips. We have one tip that came up in the in the chat but from our presenters Kate or Jim had the you, kind of help students become more concise.

[00:50:33]
Are there ways to do that? I think so.
>> So one of the things that I've done in usually when, usually in the context of my class, when a student's long winded usually they're not answering the question that I had intended. So I'll stop the student and go sorry, Rob, I hear what you're saying, I apologize, I didn't do a very good job of asking that question.

[00:50:59]
What I would like to know is what's the most important thing that Andrew should be thinking about in terms of the balance sheet as she's making this decision? So I will try to put that in most of the time, it's actually true, it's not I mean, you can't do it.

[00:51:10]
If it's not To have the students clearly off, that's a different strategy. But I often find I'm responsible for the diffused and unfocused answer with a diffused and unfocused question. And I'll just take it back, apologize, restart the conversation, and I would say 9 times out of 10 that that fixes it for me
>> Thank you, so there are some other ones in the in the chat and I want to see.

[00:51:38]
So somebody is asking about the best breakout group size? And I think it might depend on the types of tasks you're doing. So I wonder if the three of you have sizes that you do and why you choose the size that you choose for your breakout rooms.
>> I can speak to that, so I think I think I kind of agree with that with the answers.

[00:52:02]
Sort of five to six is a good number, I also agree with you that it depends on what you're doing. One thing you might wanna have an extra is you do have people drop out, and if you're doing a pre assigned list. Some people might not be in the class that you don't catch that they're not there.

[00:52:19]
And so you never want a breakout, you don't want someone by themselves and breakout room or just with one other person unless it's a pairwise activity. So I would kind of add an extra person on what you're your target number is, but you want it to be small enough.

[00:52:32]
If you think about, I'm gonna put them in break for eight minutes. If you have five people, divide eight by five, and they're only gonna get to speak for that many minutes and half-minutes, right? So it's like when you just think about the air time, you get them too big, no one really has a chance to say anything.

[00:52:49]
So it's kind of like time, time plus size, I think it's a good connection of it.
>> Our course was heavy roleplay.
>> Second year, I guess it's called a CA I just spoke to her this morning and she said that she valued two people breakouts, because of you had to engage.

[00:53:08]
But, I guess it depends on how big a class you have because if you have 30 breakout groups, the probability of having being called on is very low so you don't have to do much.
>> Yet we did George we had the same experience we did to ours was heavy role play in the course.

[00:53:29]
>> We found students really appreciated the ability to practice, so we sent them cues during the breakout session, now it's time for you to change roles. And go in I think at least in the context of what we were trying to accomplish to was the right number, your TA or your course assistant has to be really aggressive.

[00:53:47]
About managing those, right, so they have to make sure that people aren't stranded and so it's not a productive it's not a real interesting conversation when you're the only one [LAUGH] there. So that requires a little bit of effort, but we found it to be highly effective with students.

[00:54:03]
>> I found that I only use breakouts a couple of times.
>> Just the flow of my classes, breakouts weren't really part of it when I did use the, and when it worked, it was really good. But when it was bad, it was really bad, so it's one of those, which kind of leads to the Another point that I wanted to make later.

[00:54:21]
In the technology, don't feel like in your first class, you've got to like, have zoom and polls and breakouts and everything else. Like just like, put the ball in play for the first couple of class sessions. And then like say, okay, now I think I'm ready to try polls.

[00:54:34]
And now I'm ready to try this give be kind to yourself, because this is really hard and really different than anything you've ever done. The other thing I'll say that I did is if you're teaching a course that you've taught in the pas and you know the material.

[00:54:46]
Go back and script it down to the minute and that's how I when I was taught to teach 20 years ago by Robert Bergman. That was the way I was taught, I would be on this whiteboard for five minutes and I want it to look like this and this whiteboard for eight minutes.

[00:54:59]
I want it to look like this, the old Harvard way of teaching, which most of us don't teach that way anymore. But I actually found that discipline to be really helpful because. Because now I knew what exactly every class was going to do, and by the end of the quarter.

[00:55:11]
Then I was kind of more into a flow and I could like let it go easier because I knew what the class is going to be like. So I guess you're Jimmy the point, practice, practice, practice. I want to encourage you to kind of over prepare, in particular for the first two past weeks.

[00:55:24]

>> Right I'm gonna switch to a warm call type technique. I see a question came in from Brian about, I think might be for Jim about hosting guests So Brian, I'm in a second. I'm going to have you on Mike and ask your question, and Deborah, you're gonna be next to ask your question about accountability.

[00:55:46]
So, Ryan, you're there? [SOUND]
>> Yeah, so we're planning to have a group of panels in our class, so we'll have four or five guests simultaneously. And I'm just wondering if there's any tips about how to manage a group like that. We never had that was the most we ever had was to.

[00:56:06]
And what we did in a polite way was just ask them, we gave them our game plan, so I want to echo what Rob said, plan, practice, practice, practice, but plan, plan plan. And then we sent them copies of our plan, not the detailed teaching notes, but the ten bullet points, and then annotated along these.

[00:56:25]
I know you have something great to say about a, b, c, would you focus on this? So we actually kind of, it flowed like it was a natural conversation in Q&A, but they had been given prompts that when this point in the discussion came up we really wanted them to make, not our points, we wanted them to make their points on this topic.

[00:56:44]
And that seemed to work pretty well. Occasionally people went kind of off script, but by and large we had good success with it.
>> Thank you. So we're gonna switch over to Deborah to ask her question about accountability for videos. But I want to also note in the chat that Alison's put a few links in there.

[00:57:05]
One of them is to give us a little feedback on this session. So Deborah, go ahead and ask your question. I think we have a couple of minutes left, and then faculty feel free to look at other questions in the chat as well to see if there's others you wanna [SOUND] type some answers to.

[00:57:20]

>> I was wondering how, if you do 15 minutes of a lecture and you have students see it, not in the classroom but asynchronously on their own time. But how do you make students accountable for that? Cuz a lot of stuff's happening where if they were in the class those 15 minutes, they'd be there, they'd be watching.

[00:57:37]
But how do you know, you don't wanna have a pop quiz after every lecture when they come back the next day. So what are ways people keep the students accountable?

>> I don't think it's that much different, Deborah, than when they're in the classroom. And by that I mean if they're not prepared for the class, how are you gonna handle that?

[00:57:54]

>> Right.
>> Some of us are softer, some of us are more intense. I'm more intense on the students. I think Stanford grad students live up to or down to whatever expectations we put on them. And so Kate and Jim both talked about at the beginning of the class what are expectations.

[00:58:08]
I've got very specific slides of this is excused absence, this is unexcused absence, this is what we expect from you. If you're not prepared tell us, but not telling me is not acceptable, right. It's like I can't be on the team if you don't bring me on the team.

[00:58:22]
And so if someone's not going to be held accountable, and by the way, it's okay to give them a U. It is okay to fail a student if he or she did not do the material. And we're an academic institution of higher learning, and they're really, really smart.

[00:58:35]
Now, to the point, yes, we're dealing with a global pandemic, but I actually think the fall is gonna be very different than the spring. The spring everything was a mess, right, we were all a mess. In the fall we're dealing with the fact that we've gotta try to kind of figure out how to do this.

[00:58:47]
Yeah, we can be kind to people who are under stress and have hard times. On the other hand, if we hold the bar high, the students will jump over it. They're amazing with what they can do. And most of them will be great. And if we know that they're gonna be great, we hold them accountable to be great.

[00:59:00]
You'll be amazed at what they'll accomplish. And when they look bad in front of their peers, they don't like that, it's not comfortable.
>> This is a tactical answer to that, Deborah. There is a function in Canvas to track views of videos. So you can go and you can see who, you turn it on you can see who did it or not.

[00:59:18]

>> Okay.
>> The first couple times I did I had my faculty assistant just tell me who didn't watch it. And I cold called some of them, I kind of warm called them, I moved off them quickly. But people started watching pretty quickly. But you've gotta make them good videos too, they can't be, someone said five or six minutes, I think that's kind of right timing.

[00:59:36]

>> Okay.
>> Unless they're really good.
>> Awesome, thank you.

>> Like a movie, then you can have them longer. Yeah, this has been really great. And I know that we're right at time so I don't wanna hold our faculty presenters beyond the time that I've asked them to be here for.

[00:59:55]
But those of us that the TL hub staff, we will definitely stay on the line for a few more minutes with you, other people are welcome to stay as well. And we can continue more discussion until we're done talking or tired of zoom. So, but at this moment let's give our faculty presenters a hand, and thank you so much for taking that time out to be here for us cuz it's really meaningful.

[01:00:20]
And I think that creating this community of you faculty and your ideas and generating how to attack the autumn quarter is definitely a good thing to do together. You're not in this alone. All right, thank you so much.